



Internal Audit Office
Development Services - 2015

Benchmarking with Comparable Cities

	Tempe	Chandler	Gilbert	Glendale	Peoria	Austin, TX	Madison, WI	Bellevue, WA	Charlotte, NC/Mecklenburg Crnty.
Population (2014 Estimated)	172,816	254,276	239,277	237,517	166,934	912,791	245,691	136,426	809,958
Square Miles	40	64	68	60	174	298	77	32	298
Permits									
Number of Permits Issued (all types) in FY2011-12; FY2012-13; FY2013-14; and FY2014-15	3494; 3769; 4097; 4411	6336; 5277; 6497; 6925	4873; 4956; 5005; 5294	5899; 7066; 5584; 6352	2753; 3647; 4010; 4583	108,494; 109,492; 101,012; 102,100	16,564; 16,881; 16,877; unknown	11,253; 12,332; 14,239; 14,263	74,852; 81,067; 87,892; 96,558
Average Value Per Building Permit ? (Commercial and Residential)	unknown	Do Not Track	Comm. 224,450 Res. 107,887	Unknown	unknown	Not tracked	2012: Commercial=\$434,925R residential=\$51,745; 2013: Commercial=\$511,112 Residential=\$64,505; 2014: Commercial=\$499,805 Residential=\$70,520	2012: Comm.=\$181,157 Resid.=\$71,957 2013: Comm.=\$419,425 Resid.=\$120,723 2014: Comm.=\$618,215 Resid.=\$158,859 2015: Comm.=\$794,439 Resid.=\$165,670	unknown
Do you offer online tracking of permit applications?	NOT AT THIS TIME	Yes	Yes	NO	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Can you email permits to applicants?	ONLY A "COPY" OF AN ISSUED PERMIT	No	Yes	YES	Yes	Usually they print or pickup, but we can email	Some, Minor Mechanical and Building, i.e windows and siding.	Yes	Yes
Plan Checks									
Number of Plan Checks Completed in FY2011-12; FY2012-13; FY2013-14; FY2014-15	1473; 1482; 1720; 1635 (including counter reviews)	Not Tracked	2,103; 2,942; 2,956; 2,907	3140; 3331; 2792; 3195	2270; 3163; 4110; 4544	Comm.: 2,612; 2,491; 2,424; 3,026 Resid: 9787; 11618; 9984; 11153	1195; 1466; 1490; unknown	13564; 15396; 18204; 18232	Commercial: 8,879; 8,979; 11,592; 11,757
Number of Plan Reviewers (Not Included with the number of inspectors)	6 (5 regular and 1 temp)	5	3	5	4	Commer -13 Resid-13 Permit staff-11	3	18.85	32
Do you offer electronic plan submission?	Yes	No	Yes	NO	Yes	Currently limited to certain projects, but transitioning to all electronic in 2016	No	Yes	Yes
What are your published turnaround times for administrative and substantive review?	15 admin/350 substantive	10 & 20 days	3 days admin. ; 13 working days for comm. 12 working days for Res. First review	1st review: Comm. 8-20 days, Resid. 1-15 days; 2nd review: Comm. 8-13 days, Resid. 1-11 days	10 Days	21 days	5 Days	No response	5 days small commercial; 10 days single family
What are your average actual turnaround times (admin/substantive)?	Not tracked. As an estimate, average Admin review times are 1 to 2 days; average Substantive review times are within 0 to 3 days of published times.	5 days and 18 days	1 day admin. 8 working days comm. 11 working days res.	Same as above	1 Day	32 days	1.5 days	No response	24 hours
What percentage of applications do you fail to meet published turnaround times?	estimated 10-20%	0%	Not tracked	0%	Information Not Available	87%	9%	No response	8% commercial; 20% residential
What percentage of applications do you find deficiencies during the admin and substantive review process?	Not tracked. As an estimate, it is probably around 10% for admin & 50% for substantive	Bldg 80%, Civil 100%	Not tracked	10%	Information Not Available	75-80%	28%	No response	50%
Are plan review fees paid upon submission of the application?	Yes	Yes	Yes	YES	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Note: Due to variations in organizational structures, duties and responsibilities of like-named positions, and definition of terms, it is difficult to make direct comparison between cities.



Internal Audit Office
Development Services - 2015

Benchmarking with Comparable Cities

	Tempe	Chandler	Gilbert	Glendale	Peoria	Austin, TX	Madison, WI	Bellevue, WA	Charlotte, NC/Mecklenburg Cmty.
What is the basis of plan review fee?	Valuation	Valuation	Project valuation	75% of permit fee	Typically Valuation	New-Sq Ft Remodel-\$ value	\$0.03 per sq ft, \$100.00 minimum.	ICC BVD Table	We have two methods, one is total construction cost, and projects over a million dollars - Plan Review charges are \$145.00 hour
If based on valuation, who assesses the valuation?	Provided by applicant. For addition or new buildings, it is either the declared valuation or the calculated (per our cost per sq ft table) valuation whichever one is greater. On other projects, staff will question the applicant's valuation if they feel it is to low based on their experience. We would ask for a signed copy of the work contract to verify stated valuation.	Plan Reviewer	Front counter (C.S.P.'s)	We do - per our published schedule	Counter Staff	Intake staff	No response	Reviewers	We do
Do you allow architects or engineers to self-certify (Self-plan-review) their own	No	Yes	No	NO	Yes	No	No	No	No
Do you charge for modification requests? If so, how much?	Yes: \$393 comm/\$197 resid.	Yes, \$150	Yes \$93.00/hr	YES = \$ 349.53	Yes, Varies Per Application	Yes \$1,310	Revisions are \$100.00	If the permit is issued we charge based on the number of building review hours spent	Yes, \$145/hr.
Average # trips a customer makes to your office for application and plan review	Not tracked. Estimated 2-3 trips	2	1	4	6	2-4 depending on experience	2	Not tracked	none, work through electronic means
Inspections									
Do you offer online inspection scheduling?	NOT AT THIS TIME. Expected implementation 2016.	Yes	Yes	No, only by automated phone system	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Can you email Certificates of Occupancy to applicants?	YES	No	Yes	YES	Yes	Yes and pickup	Yes	Yes, once signed	Yes
Do you allow customers to contact inspectors directly?	YES 6-6:30 AM ONLY	Yes	Yes	With inspector's permission	Yes	Yes cell phones	Yes	Yes	NO; automated service handles phones but they do have Ipads, phones and e-mail
Do you allow inspectors to go to the same site more than once a day?	YES, IN SPECIAL CASES	Yes	Yes	Yes if requested by customer and approved by inspector	Only if they have time	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
What technology (laptops, Tablets, software) do you utilize for inspections?	SMART PHONES AND A FEW TABLETS (TRIAL BASIS), ACCELA, IVR	Laptop, Accela Automation	None at this time; we are implementing Energov in July 2016 and will be utilizing ipads for inspections	Software - Hansen permit system	Laptops Accela	Tablets	Piloting Mobile Apps. Accela	Tablets - AMANDA Mobile	phones, Ipads, Surface, Blue Beam(for viewing plans), BIM software
Do you have documented efficiencies and time savings attributed to technology? If so, what?	NO	N/A	Not at this time	NO	No	All work done in AMANDA (permits, plan review, inspections etc)	no	Just started 5/2015, not enough stats	No
Average number of inspections per Full Time inspector in a day	55.6 in 2015	10 to 15 a day	Inspector I (residential only)- 32; Inspector II (commercial & residential) - 12; Fire Inspector (new construction) - 6	9 to 12	35	23	15	9.8/day	14-16

Note: Due to variations in organizational structures, duties and responsibilities of like-named positions, and definition of terms, it is difficult to make direct comparison between cities.



Internal Audit Office
Development Services - 2015

Benchmarking with Comparable Cities

	Tempe	Chandler	Gilbert	Glendale	Peoria	Austin, TX	Madison, WI	Bellevue, WA	Charlotte, NC/Mecklenburg Crnty.
Average minutes allowed per inspection by type	15 MINUTES	Not Tracked	Not tracked	30 minutes not including travel time	Not currently tracked	Not tracked- depends on size of project	20	35-40 min for all types depending on workload. Includes travel time between inspections.	30-60 mins (estimate)
Inspection disapproval Rate (Percentage)	26%	40%	Not tracked	0.5	Not Tracked	28%	5	10 – 22% depending on type of work. Overall average is 16%	avg 1.7%
Number of Inspectors	1 BUILDING INSP. MANAGER, 1 SR. INSPECTOR, 4 INSPECTOR II, 1 INSPECTOR I, 5 CONTRACT TEMPORARY BLDG. INSPECTORS, 1 SR. PLANNER - SITE INSPECTOR.	10	(10) Total: (4) Inspector I's, (4) Inspector II's, (1) Senior Inspector (supervisor), (1) Fire Inspector	8	9	47	4 Building, 3 Plumb/HVAC, 4 Elect/HVAC Total=11	27	86
Total commercial and residential sq. footage inspected for FY2011-12, FY2012-13, FY2013-14, and FY2014-15	NOT TRACKED	Not Tracked	Not tracked	Commercial only: 1,811,639 SF for FY13-14, 1,352,890 for FY 14-15	Information Not Available	Not tracked	2012: Comm.=4,496,828 SF Residential=900,105 SF 2013: Comm.=6,450,091 SF Residential=1,168,149 SF 2014: Comm.=6,123,232 SF Residential=1,261,141 SF	No response	No response
Miscellaneous									
Number of Customers Served for FY2011-12; FY2012-13; FY2013-14; FY2014-15	9,759; 10,475; 12,307; 13,136	Not Tracked	Not tracked	8386; 8852; 9083; unknown	Information Not Available	28,227; 33,128; 33,035; 32,050	[2012=16564, 2013=16,881, 2014=16,877]	No response	177,661; 207,988; 238,068; 261,121
Number of Customer Complaints Received in FY2011-12; FY2012-13; FY2013-14; FY2014-15	NOT TRACKED	5; 3; 1; 1	Not tracked	unknown	Information Not Available	Not tracked	1 formal complaint this year.	No response	Not tracked, very few
What software systems do you use?	ACCELA AUTOMATION	Accela Automation	EDEN - Tyler Technologies	Hansen 7.7	Accela	AMANDA by CSCD Systems	Acella	AMANDA	Computronix, Posse, Winchester, Selectron, Cliso, Blue Beam, ACF
Do you try to cover all of your costs with fees collected from customers?	NO	Yes	No	YES	yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Total # positions overall and by type of position	30	33	43	22.75	27	122	4 Building, 3 Plumb/HVAC, 4 Elect/HVAC Total=11	56	225
Fast Track									
Do you offer a Fast Track program?	Yes	Yes	Yes	YES	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes
What administrative fees are charged for your Fast Track program?	35% of the plan review fee we would have charged	Double plan review fee	100% of plan review fee	300% of normal plan review fees	None	\$49	NA	N/A	\$1,500
What is the time frame for your Fast Track program?	Unknown; timeframes not set by City	10 days	1/2 posted plan review times	1/2 of normal plan review time	1/2 the published review time	1 day/at initial meeting	NA	N/A	2 weeks
Do you utilize Third Party Plan Review services?	Yes.	No	Yes	NO	Not currently	No	No	Yes - we utilize consultants	Yes
Number of Fast Track applications processed in FY2011-12; FY2012-13; FY2013-14 and FY2014-15	We have not had anyone use the program	Not tracked	0; 0; 122; 188	Unknown	6	Commercial 1,940; 1,661; 1,585; 1,976	NA	N/A	N/A; N/A; N/A; 186

Note: Due to variations in organizational structures, duties and responsibilities of like-named positions, and definition of terms, it is difficult to make direct comparison between cities.