· T · E · M · P · E ·
PRESERVATION

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Mike Deskin
Elias Y. Esquer
Bob Gasser, Chair
Dan Killoren
Ann Patterson
Stu Siefer, RA
Liz Wilson, Vice-Chair

Alternate Members:
Steve Idle
Donna Marshak

♦ ♦ ♦

HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER

Joe Nucci, RA

♦

The City of Tempe is a Certified Local Government, in association with the United States Department of the Interior / National Park Service

♦

Tempe Historic Preservation Office
Community Development Department
21 East 6th Street, Suite 208
P.O. Box 5002
Tempe, AZ 85280

♦ ♦ ♦

480.350.8028
8579 FAX; 8913TDD

CITY OF TEMPE ARIZONA

Tempe Historic Preservation Commission [Tempe HPC]

MEETING MINUTES

Meeting Date:	Thursday, November 08, 2007
Location:	Hatton Hall 34 East Seventh Street
Commissioners Present:	Mike Deskin Elias Esquer Bob Gasser Dan Killoren Ann Patterson Liz Wilson [6:12] Stu Siefer Donna Marshak [alternate] Steve Idle [alternate]
Staff Present:	Joe Nucci Mark Vinson Chris Messer Hansen Bill Kersbergen Neil Calfee Lisa Collins Amy Douglass
Public Present:	Chris Higgins, Scott Ellison, Eddie Goitia, Darin Price, Francis Reilly, Charles Lee, Kuryams Phung, Steve Bassett, Michael Monti, Christen Monti, Mario Miranda, Betty Enz, Dick Enz, Katie Nelson, Jason Rose, David Decker, Tony Wall, Dennis Newcombe, Pam Rector, Lisa Roach, Daniel Gottuleb, Paul Gilbert

Call to Order: 6:00 pm, Bob Gasser, Chair

1. Call to Audience
INFORMATION ONLY- NO COMMENT

2. Approval of HPC Meeting Minutes

MOTION MADE TO APPROVE THE OCTOBER 18, 2007 MEETING MINUTES WITH THE ADDITION OF 'ADOBE' BUILDINGS TO PAGE 3, BULLET POINT 8. [AP]; MOTION SECOND [EE]; PASSED 6:0, WITH TWO ALTERNATES ALSO APPROVING.

[Note: Agenda reordered at meeting.]

4. Discussion of Historic Preservation Incentives

Neil Calfee, Tempe Deputy Community Development Manager, Redevelopment + Revitalization

- Request from staff for HPC to identify 1-year, 5-year priorities
- Identify incentives which would be most useful; have greatest impact
- Calfee will return to December meeting for in-depth discussion on incentives

3. Proposed Alterations to THPR #11 - C.T. Hayden House [Monti's La Casa Vieja]

[SPR 07096] One Hundred Mill Avenue, 100 S. Mill Ave.

Paul Gilbert, Attorney for 3W Companies, One Hundred Mill Avenue LLC

APPLICANT PRESENTATION:

- Summary of project / process to date
- Applicant has returned with plan which preserves the historic 'L'-shaped Sonoran row house and entire historic portion of building
- New building is set back 6' from south façade of adobe building [to be used as service corridor for restaurant]
- Extreme top portion of new tower overhangs enclosed courtyard portion of restaurant 10'
- Revised proposal incorporates previous comments; we've listened and done what you asked us to do
- The additions from 1968+ will be demolished; 11,000 SF footprint created by original Hayden family will remain

COMMISSION COMMENTS / QUESTIONS:

- New proposal shows value of Historic Preservation
- Desire to ensure foundation work doesn't threaten adobe [condition #3 in Staff Report addresses this concern – see below]
- Scott Ellison: shoring will be conducted next to foundation; set monitors will ensure nothing moves; roof will be protected during construction
- Historic Preservation Plan will be submitted for approval which address these concerns
- Staff Recommendations read into record:

Therefore, with respect to proposed alterations to ***Tempe Historic Property Register*** **#11 - C.T. Hayden House [Monti's La Casa Vieja]**, the THPO staff recommends approval of the conceptual / PAD stage of the proposed project as presented, subject to the following conditions:

1. Historic signage / interpretive element be added to project at Rio Salado Parkway façade to inform public of historic 'L'-shaped Sonoran row-house [period of significance] as well as the Hayden and Monti family association / significance.
2. Any structured parking immediately to the south or west of and above the historic building to be screened with permanent, designed glazing, scrim or screen [could be a public art component] instead of massive solid wall / undetermined mural.
3. Conduct geotechnical testing prior to structural design to determine subsurface conditions. Based on testing submit an Historic Preservation Plan, structural report, structural details, and indication of methods for protecting existing site features during construction. Tempe Historic Preservation Office approval of the Preservation Plan is a condition precedent to permit issue.
4. Prepare a Phased Archaeological Treatment Plan for areas scheduled for ground disturbing activities. The Treatment Plan will be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Archaeological Documentation [48 FR 44734-37]. Tempe Historic Preservation Office approval of the Treatment Plan is a condition precedent to permit issue.

5. Cantilevered overhangs above not to extend over the historic 'L'-shaped Sonoran row house portion of the structure below.
6. Building elevations, materials and design details, with respect to their compatibility with and sensitivity to the historic resource are subject to HPC approval prior to final design review approval by Development Review Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

- Q: What is the proposed height? A: 300' total in Phase I tower; 325' Phase II
- Comment: Words that come to mind are 'arrogance', 'obscene', 'excessive'
- How can you say by removing part of the building the context is preserved or enhanced?
- The immediate proximity bothers me the most; it is too close to the historic building
- People should be pleased – it is great, it could have been awful, but it is great

COMMISSION COMMENTS:

- We've reviewed Secretary of Interior's Standards in past meetings; this proposal meets these standards with the exception of ~~'context'~~ SETTING.
- 'Mill Crossing' area is gateway to Downtown Tempe – the bridge, Hayden Flour Mill, W.P.A. ball fields / wall and Monti's all go together to produce a gateway which is the historic context
- Applicant has been incredibly accommodating and brought forward a project that is sustainable for future generations
- Chair personally thanked Commissioner for forcing a revisit to the drawing board, which ultimately produced a better design solution

MOTION MADE TO APPROVE PROPOSED MODIFICATIONS TO THPR #11 SUBJECT TO STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS [MD]; MOTION SECOND [SS]; PASSED 7:0, WITH TWO ALTERNATES ALSO IN FAVOR.

5. Discuss + Establish Assignments for Commission Council Liaisons

- Discussion and consensus reached for individual assignments
- Master list with contact info will be drafted for next meeting
- Request for HPO staff to draft list of talking points for consistent communication

6. Discuss & Consider Chair / Staff Updates:

- **Follow up on Parks + Rec. Board Meeting for Hayden Butte Staff Report** – review of draft Staff Report by HPO, minor changes before submitting to Parks staff
- **CDBG process outlined for Design Guidelines for Borden Homes HD, Tomlinson Estates HD, and Roosevelt Addition HD** – direction from Community Development Director to utilize CDBG funding for design guidelines for each of the three HD's, and continue with SHPO Federal pass-thru grant for Roosevelt Addition National Register nomination; SHPO confirms CDBG funds can be used for a city match portion
- **Federal [SHPO pass-through] grant status for Roosevelt Addition National Register Nomination** – to be updated in December

7. Discuss Future Agenda Items:

- **Commission Elections** – March set for annual cycle beginning in 2008
- **HPC Priorities** – to be combined with December discussion with Neil Calfee; Staff to include list of priorities identified in previous meeting in December packet
- **Neil Calfee update** – existing development plans / HP projects
- **City Attorney update** – Board + Commission training summary [January]
- **Ordinance Rewrite update** – status of Mayor's request to staff; process outlined [January]
- **Prop 207** – What can we do about it? [January]

Meeting adjourned at 7:55 PM.
Minutes scheduled for Tempe HPC approval on 02/14/2008.

Bob Gasser, Chair

Rdevpub/HistoricPreservation/HPCmins110807.doc

HPCmins110807.doc filed City Clerk 02/19/08 Krosschell, Connie; Fillmore, Karen; Stennerson, Julie & posted to www.tempe.gov/historicpres

Draft issued for review comments to:	Review comments received from:
☑	❒

FREQUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS OR ACRONYMS

CDD – City of Tempe Community Development Department: Established February 15, 2005, by City Manager Will Manley the CDD consists of six divisions; Economic Development, Housing Services, Redevelopment, Neighborhood Enhancement, Rio Salado/Town Lake, and Special Projects, as well as the Community Design Studio / City Architect. The Tempe Historic Preservation Office is an agency of the Special Projects Division.

CLG – Certified Local Government: In 1980, Congress established a framework for local preservation programs through an amendment to the National Historic Preservation Act empowering Arizona cities and counties to become Certified Local Governments (CLGs). Once certified, these entities are eligible for specialized assistance and funds for developing their own local preservation programs and entitled to comment on NR and other SHPO activities within their boundaries. The City of Tempe became a CLG in 1995.

DDA – Development & Disposition Agreement: a redevelopment contract between the City and one or more developers or redevelopers specifying terms and conditions for construction or reconstruction.

DSD – City of Tempe Development Services Department: dealing with Building Safety, Land Use, Planning and Zoning

DRC – City of Tempe Development Review Commission: volunteer board advising Mayor and Council on matters related to the built environment and administration of General Plan 2030 and the Zoning and Development Code.

HPAC – Historic Preservation Advisory Committee: Arizona State Parks is governed by the State Parks Board and receives direction and oversight from several advisory committees and groups such as the Historic Preservation Advisory Committee.

IEBC – International Existing Building Code: adopted by Tempe City Council by Ordinance No. 2005.89 on December 1, 2005, as part of the code body promulgated by the International Code Council, provides means for preservation of existing Tempe building inventory through reasonable and feasible code processes.

IRS – Issue Review Session: informal Mayor and Council public meeting where members of the public may come forward and talk with City Council during the "Call to the Audience" prior to regular Council meetings.

PAD – Planned Area Development: site plan overlay to define development standards for a specific project.

SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office: a division of Arizona State Parks, responsible for the identification, evaluation, and protection of Arizona's prehistoric and historic cultural resources; established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.

SRP-MIC – Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community: created by Executive Order on June 14, 1879 by President Rutherford B. Hayes, the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRPMIC) is located in Maricopa County, aside the boundaries of Mesa, Tempe, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills and metropolitan Phoenix.

Tempe HPC – Tempe Historic Preservation Commission: Created by Ordinance 95.35, adopted November 9, 1995. Members serve three year terms with the exception of the initial appointments; charged with administering the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance and Plan, as well as advising Mayor / Council on all matters related to historic preservation

Tempe HPF – Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation: A private nonprofit corporation established in 2005, Mission Statement 02.02.06 "The Tempe HPF advocates preserving Tempe's at-risk historic properties and supporting worthy preservation projects through education, community participation, and fundraising."

Tempe HPO – Tempe Historic Preservation Office: Responsible for the identification and conservation of Tempe's prehistoric and historic cultural resources, the Office uses Federal, state, and city funding for the historic preservation program and assists owners of historic properties with grant applications, property maintenance, and preservation activities; provides staff support to the Tempe HPC.

THM – Tempe Historical Museum: Located at 809 E. Southern Avenue in Tempe, the Tempe Historical Museum is a center where the community comes together to celebrate Tempe's past and ponder the future. Permanent and changing exhibits, educational programs, and research projects generally focus on some aspect of Tempe's history within the context of state and national events.

TOD – Tempe Transportation Overlay District: placed to encourage appropriate land development and redevelopment consistent with and complementary to the community's focused investment in transit, bicycle, and pedestrian infrastructure in certain geographic areas of the City; typically in association with the light rail.

ZDC – Zoning & Development Code: Adopted by Mayor and Council on January 20, 2005, effective February 22, 2005, the ZDC implements Tempe General Plan 2030 by encouraging creative development of the built environment in order to build a community that promotes the livability and uniqueness of Tempe; establishes zoning districts and development standards.