Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held at the Hatton Hall, 34 East Seventh Street, Tempe, Arizona.

Regular Meeting 6:02 PM

Present: Chuck Buss, Chair
         Martin Ball, Vice-Chair
         Matthew Bilsbarrow
         Chris Garraty
         Jim Garrison

Staff: Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner
       John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer
       Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant

1) Call to Audience: Persons wishing to address the Commission on any matter may do so at the discretion of the Chair. However, Arizona Open Meeting Law limits Commission discussion to matters listed on the posted agenda. Other topics may be placed on a future agenda for discussion.

2) Voting of the Meeting Minutes

   Motion by Commissioner Ball to approve the Meeting Minutes of May 8, 219; second by Commissioner Bilsbarrow. Motion passed on 5-0 vote.
   Ayes: Chuck Buss, Martin Ball, Matthew Bilsbarrow, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison
   Nays: None
   Abstain: None
   Absent: Gregory Larson, Elizabeth Gilbert, Laurence Montero, Joe Nucci

3) HPC Membership expansion/ Four Southern Tribes representation

   Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

   Mr. Southard informed the Commission that there has been some discussion about adding representation of the Four Southern Tribes. The options that have been discussed are to have just one of the tribes specifically, a rotation between them, or a rotation between just Gila River given the aerial of responsibility there. Prior to exploring the matter further wanted to know the take on how the Commission feel the appointment should be made what type of role would be assigned.

   Commission Discussion
Chair Buss asked if this would be a designation to one of the nine commissioner spots or a tenth one.

Mr. Southard informed the commissioners that this information has not been determined yet there are still working out the logistics of rather it would be an appointment that would take place at the end of the term or an addition too or a membership like the history museum has. According to the Ordinance they do have to be a Tempe Resident however Ordinance can be revised.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Garraty.

Commissioner Garraty stated that he believes this is a fantastic idea and he encourages it. In his line of profession that are not legally required to contact the tribes for involvement unless you suspect it is a burial ground in which you would need to get a burial grievance from the Arizona State Museum and often that is the first time that they hear about these types of projects. It would be great to get the tribes in early in the process and to get their knowledge of the areas that are secret places and traditional culture properties.

Chair Buss acknowledged Vice Chair Ball

Vice Chair Ball stated that he would also appreciate their point of view being incorporated. One of the things that Vice Chair Ball has seen while serving on the commission is how much richer the historic properties and pre-historic properties views are when you incorporate archaeology, anthropology, history, and social significance from different stand points. Would like to hear back from City Staff before the decision is final about the legal requirements and the way that the Commission will meet the standards that are currently in the City Ordinance and Charter.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Garrison

Commissioner Garrison informed the board that having an advocate on the board at the start is a wonderful ideal. He also feels that it is in their best interest as well as the commissions to get the feedback.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Bilsbarrow

Commissioner Bilsbarrow stated that he would like to give some ideas of implementing the process. Such as making it a liaison position where they may or may not have terms. These individuals would be representing their government, so it is a different role then a Commissioner but still apart of the commission.

Chair Buss stated that it would be unanimous and that he is aware that it is a requirement that you must be a City of Tempe resident however they could always argue the point that they were here before anyone else. So, they still have ties to the City of Tempe.

Mr. Southard stated that he is aware that there are some Cities that have members that do not reside in the City they serve due to the lack of representation of the group.

Chair Buss asked if Mr. Southard had a lot of interaction with the Tribes.

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that he does and feels that this would be a great addition and he is pleased to hear that it is unanimous that everyone wants to go further in the process.

---------------

4) Certified Local Government Review of Proposed Amendment to University Park National Register Documentation

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer
Mr. Southard informed the Commission that the University Park is a challenging district unlike every other national registered district in Tempe the property owners opted against pursuing local designation. The purposed changes and demolition, with changes in floor or adding in the rear, the historic preservation office try to make a point in weighing in when the opportunity presents itself if the property is contributing property to purpose rather the alternations are going to impact the classification program. However, the purposed projects do not come to the Historic Preservation Committee due to not being locally designated. This is particularly problematic for University Park because when listed it has a 54 percent contributing properties which is a low number and has been a low number from the start. There have been several alterations and additions over the years. There have been some questions to the on-going illegibility of University Park following the demolition of 25 E 13th Street which the Kimber Goodwin home was. The day after it was demolished the shipo staff drove through University park with the intent of assessing the area to determine if the properties need to be reclassified. The handouts that were given to the commissioners show the 6 properties that are not contributing be set to contributing and 5 that are contributing be set to non-contributing which will give a net gain to one for contributing properties.

**Commission Discussion**

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Garrison.

Commissioner Garrison asked if Mr. Southard has any thoughts on any other properties and he feels that everything else is very straight forward regarding integrity verses non-integrity per the regulations. Commissioner Garrison feels that the commission has an obligation to look beyond the one that is going to be added as a contributing but the whole district.

Mr. Southard stated that was a very good point and if he must guess that on July 26 there will be more discussion on the topic.

Chair Buss acknowledged Vice Chair Ball

Vice Chair Ball stated that while yes, the contributors seem fluided since a lot of modification has occurred. However there needs to be a consideration of the landscape character of irrigation in the neighborhood and experiencing what the neighborhood is of equal value to the individual merits of the structure in knowing that there are challenges in trying to build in the area. Vice Chair Ball would hate to see a delisting that might cause further erosion of the character of the environment as opposed to the character of the individual pieces of it.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Bilsbarrow

Commissioner Bilsbarrow stated that he agrees with what has been said and would like to add that in the form they were given according to 25 E 13th Street the house was demolished in 2019 and a new house has been approved for construction which will be non-contributing because it is outside the district period of significance. He would like to see that part removed or stricken because it is speculative. The commission would like to have people preserve the properties and if they do not want to participate in being a historic property that is ok as well.

Chair Buss asked for clarification on rather there was a building permit filed on the property already. And if that is the case then that would preclude that there is going to be a different historic structure on the property then he is ok with leaving the sentence there.

Mr. Southard stated that to his understanding there was a permit filed.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Garrison.

Commissioner Garrison pointed out that on the map in the northwest corner there were five non-contributors on the corner and the general rule is that if you have a non-contributor at the edge of the district you take it out and the five properties would be deleted. At the same time if any of those five have a chance at being contributing then that should not happen.
Chair Buss ask for clarification to rather they should just adjust the boundaries.

Commissioner Garrison stated that is correct.

Chair Buss acknowledged Vick Linoff from the Audience.

Mr. Linoff stated that the caption under Figure 8 is mislabeled it is showing a different address.

Commissioner Garrison asked if there needs to be a motion.

Mr. Southard stated that at this moment this is just a review and he will comply what has been said and put it in a letter and send it out to the historic preservation office.

5) Hayden Butte communication tower removal update

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commission that the tower is gone. They worked closely with the team in vising and revising the removal strategy of the tower. The completion of the project is due to the workings of Alex Smith Deputy Director of Special Projects with the coordination of the Tempe Police Department and Federal Agencies relocating their equipment. Mr. Smith also worked to secure funding and worked with Gila River Tribe to make sure that the removal was done in a sensitive manor. The strategy was to remove everything in its entirety. As they removed the foundation from the bedrock they had someone present incase there was any artifacts that need to be identified, and work could be stopped and asses what needed to be done. However, there were no interruptions, and everything was complete.

Commission Discussion

Chair Buss asked what was the outcome of the footing was it taken down to ground level.

Mr. Southard stated that it was removed to ground level there is a remnant of concert that remains but what was left was determined that it was better to leave then attempt to remove and risk damaging the Butte.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Bilsbarrow

Commissioner Bilsbarrow suggested that this project should receive a preservation award, or should the opportunity arise be nominated.

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Garraty.

Commissioner Garraty stated that it looks like a lot of the concert had already been damaged.

Mr. Southard stated that is correct when the tower was originally put in there was damage done to the peak.

6) Charles T. Hayden House Update

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commission that the Hayden House work continues making Adobe and repairing as well as working on the final details. There is a Spanish Blue painting in the Alco wood that dates to 1924. The archaeology there is a data testing and recovery for the overall property but within the walls themselves in the area that was excavated for a one-foot footing was monitored and there is an unknown plaster like decaying wood beam.
**Commission Discussion**

Chair Buss acknowledged Commissioner Garraty.

Commissioner Garraty stated that this is an exciting found appears to be a wall footer that is below the existing courtyard which pre-dates itself.

Mr. Southard stated that the Tucson Newspaper dated December of 1843 stated that Charles Hayden moved to Tempe permanently at that time. Therefore it was not originally a place of permanent resident.

Chair Buss stated that he is very happy to hear about the color.

----------------------

7) **Chair / Staff Updates**

Steve informed the Commissioners that next meeting will happen on August 14, 2019 and at the next meeting there will be a preamble to start off the meeting going forward.

----------------------

8) **Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items**

- Member Announcements
- **Staff Announcements**

Hearing adjourned at 6:50pm

----------------------

Prepared by: Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant
Reviewed by:

[Signature]

SA:bn