Tempe Historic Preservation Commission [Tempe HPC]

MEETING MINUTES

Date: THURSDAY, October 9, 2014

Location: Hatton Hall, 34 E. 7th St., Tempe

Commissioners Present: Ira Bennett, Chuck Buss, Andrea Gregory, Lauren Proper, Brenda Shears, Scott Solliday, Korri Turner

Staff Present: Hansen, Billy Kiser, Joe Nucci, Mark Vinson

Public Present: Michael Brekka, Grady Gammage, Jr., Rob Lane, Vic Linoff, Lisa Roach, Manjula Vaz, Nore’ Winter

Call to Order: 6:04 P.M., Andrea Gregory, Chair

1. Call to Audience NO REPLY

2. Approval of HPC Minutes 09/11/2014

MOTION [BENNETT]: MOVE TO APPROVE TEMPE HPC MEETING MINUTES FROM 09/11/2014, SECOND [SOLLIDAY], APPROVED 6-0.

3. Presentation Hayden House Redevelopment Approach

- Nore’ Winter presentation on historical research
- Explanation of why the property is historically significant
- Emphasis on architect Robert T. Evans and 1924 restoration
- Chronological overview, 1871-2000
- Guiding principles for redevelopment: preserve historic adobe building; remove incompatible additions; create new courtyard in conformity with historic character; construct supporting infrastructure sensitively
- Overview of alternative plan concepts (3 total)
- Presentation of 3 plan concepts for new layout
- Hotel will be 15 stories (195’) and office building will be 16 stories (210’)
- Q: What is the content of the 1984 NRN for the Hayden House? A: It is a brief, superficial document; the 50-year threshold for historic eligibility is not being applied to this project, as there are many variables and different historically significant components
- Solliday: explanation on arbitrary nature of period of significance; 1871 may not be the year built, and the 1930s as a cutoff date is too vague
- THPR nomination for the Hayden House (2000) uses the same period of significance and historical associations as the 1984 NRN and is being consulted for the project
- Discussion on strategy for restoring front façade and patio, and plans for integration of the two in conformity with historic character and context
- Shade structures will be needed for front patio and entryway (Rio Salado frontage)
- 1920s photos are helping with the guiding principles for restoration of front entryway and patio
- Gammage: Recently-built concrete-and-iron structure at NE corner of Hayden House will be removed.
• Q: Will new restaurant have enough seating to be profitable? A: Yes, the new building will be more reasonable in size. The current Monti’s is too large, with seating capacity of approximately 1,000. New restaurant will be roughly one-third the square footage (3,500-4,000) and will conform with the incoming high-end restaurateur.
• Q: Will new restaurant concept allow for community meetings and gatherings? A: Probably not; new concept will be upscale and will not appeal to such groups, but adjacent new hotel will also have restaurant and gathering spaces that can serve this function.
• Q: How will the shading/shadows of the new 200-foot towers impact the open-air courtyard? A: Developers still working on determining this; vegetation in the courtyard could ease the intensity of high-rises and provide more reliable shade.
• Q: Have there been any engineering studies on the proximity impacts of new high-rises on historic structure? A: Developers are working on this; measures will be taken to mitigate adverse proximity impacts.
• HPC will be voting in the future on an amended PAD, with height, lot coverage, and square footage all reduced from earlier development proposal. All residential components have also been removed from the plans.
• Vinson: Notes that the hotel and office tower are both offset from the historic Hayden House in their Rio Salado Parkway and Mill Avenue frontage; this setback will help to emphasize the historic over the new.

4. Presentation Historic Preservation Office Operations
• Nucci: Overview of HPO procedures for incoming new hire.
• Nucci: Asks commissioners to review the procedural manual and provide feedback
• Vinson: HPO job has been posted, deadline for application has passed with 36 applicants
• Applications currently being reviewed to determine those that do/do not meet the minimum qualifications; the pool of eligible applicants is being narrowed down by HR
• Vinson: An interview panel has been compiled, consisting of Mark Vinson, Nancy Ryan, Andrea Gregory, and Amy Douglass
• Goal of interview panel is to select the 2 - 4 best candidates, who will then be called for a final interview with the department director
• Nucci will volunteer beginning November 1 and lasting until a new hire is made and the transition is complete; Vinson will likely serve as interim HPO
• Bennett: Ideal skills for a new HPO would be a solution-minded problem-solving individual

5. Discuss & Consider Graduate Student Intern Program Projects
• Kiser: Research is ongoing for NRN district property tax data
• Kiser: Compiling a procedural manual for the intern program to complement Nucci’s instructional guide for the new HPO

6. Discuss and Consider Chair/Staff Updates:
• Vinson: Report on panel evaluating Flour Mill request for qualifications; 4 submittals have been received, these have been narrowed down to 2. Forthcoming meeting with city attorney on these two submittals. A hotel occupant has already been determined for the site; both of the new proposals include a restaurant as well.
• Roach: THPF has met with Rio Salado Foundation’s executive director on Eisendrath House; grant funding has been secured and construction may be resumed before the end of the year
• THPF may appoint a new liaison to HPC. Nucci will begin serving on THPF board November 1st.
• Commissioners present Nucci with framed Flour Mill sack as retirement gift
• Linoff: Comments on Nucci’s dedicated service to Tempe preservation
• Buss: Discussion of home values in historic districts; in one recent example, he found $15,000 value added for a home in a historic district (home valued at $132,000), suggesting a valued added of 10-15%, which conforms with nationwide trends.
• Roach: Her experiences in real estate have confirmed this; historic district homes have verified value added of over 10 percent, often even more in the valley, where historic properties are less common than in other parts of the U.S. and thus the supply does not meet the demand in PHX metro area.

7. Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items
• November 3, at 5:00 PM, there will be a retirement celebration for Joe Nucci at Casey Moore’s in historic Maple/Ash Neighborhood.

Meeting adjourned at 7:35 PM

Andrea Gregory, Chair

-minutes scheduled for HPC approval on 12/11/2014
FREQUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS OR ACRONYMS

- CDD – City of Tempe Community Development Department: Established February 15, 2005, by City Manager Will Manley the CDD consists of six divisions; Economic Development, Housing Services, Redevelopment, Neighborhood Enhancement, Rio Salado/Town Lake, and Special Projects, as well as the Community Design Studio / City Architect. The Tempe Historic Preservation Office is an agency of the Special Projects Division.
- CLG – Certified Local Government: In 1980, Congress established a framework for local preservation programs through an amendment to the National Historic Preservation Act empowering Arizona cities and counties to become Certified Local Governments (CLGs). Once certified, these entities are eligible for specialized assistance and funds for developing their own local preservation programs and entitled to comment on NR and other SHPO activities within their boundaries. The City of Tempe became a CLG in 1995.
- DDA – Development & Disposition Agreement: a redevelopment contract between the City and one or more developers or redevelopers specifying terms and conditions for construction or reconstruction.
- DSD – City of Tempe Development Services Department: dealing with Building Safety, Land Use, Planning and Zoning
- GRIC – Gila River Indian Community: is an alliance of two tribes, the Akimel O’odham (Pima) and the Pee Posh (Maricopa). Established by Executive Order in 1859, the Community covers more than 600 square miles and is the largest indigenous community in the Phoenix metropolitan area. GRIC helps make the Tempe Preservation Graduate Student Intern Program possible through a generous grant of State-Shared Revenue funds.
- HPF – (see Tempe HPF) Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation
- HSRC – (Arizona) Historic Sites Review Committee: Arizona’s official Arizona and National Register of Historic Places review board. The HSRC meets three times during the year to review National Register nominations and advise the State Historic Preservation Officer on nominations to the State and National Registers.
- IEBBC – International Existing Buildings Code: adopted by Tempe City Council by Ordinance No. 2005.89 on December 1, 2005, as part of the code body promulgated by the International Code Council, provides means for preservation of existing Tempe building inventory through reasonable and feasible code processes.
- IRS – Issue Review Session: informal Mayor and Council public meeting where members of the public may come forward and talk with City Council during the “Call to the Audience” prior to regular Council meetings.
- NPS – National Park Service: the City of Tempe is a Certified Local Government through an inter-governmental agreement with the United States Department of the Interior National Park Service and the Arizona State Historic Preservation Office.
- NRN – National Register Nomination: An application to list a property on the National Register of Historic Places is reviewed by the SHPO and then by the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee (Sites) before formal application is made to the Keeper of the National Register in Washington DC.
- PAD – Planned Area Development: site plan overlay to define development standards for a specific project.
- SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office: a division of Arizona State Parks, responsible for the identification, evaluation, and protection of Arizona’s prehistoric and historic cultural resources; established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.
- SRP-MIC – Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community: created by Executive Order on June 14, 1879 by President Rutherford B. Hayes, the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRPMIC) is located in Maricopa County, aside the boundaries of Mesa, Tempe, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills and metropolitan Phoenix.
- Tempe HPC – Tempe Historic Preservation Commission: Created by Ordinance 95.35, adopted November 9, 1995. Members serve three years terms with the exception of the initial appointments; charged with administering the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance and Plan, as well as advising Mayor / Council on all matters related to historic preservation.
- Tempe HPO – Tempe Historic Preservation Office: Responsible for the identification and conservation of Tempe’s prehistoric and historic cultural resources, the Office uses Federal, state, and city funding for the historic preservation program and assists owners of historic properties with grant applications, property maintenance, and preservation activities; provides staff support to the Tempe HPC.
- THM – Tempe Historical Museum: Located at 809 E. Southern Avenue in Tempe, the Tempe Historical Museum is a center where the community comes together to celebrate Tempe’s past and ponder the future. Permanent and changing exhibits, educational programs, and research projects generally focus on some aspect of Tempe’s history within the context of state and national events.
- TOD – Tempe Transportation Overlay District: placed to encourage appropriate land development and redevelopment consistent with and complementary to the community’s focused investment in transit, bicycle, and pedestrian infrastructure in certain geographic areas of the City; typically in association with the light rail.
- ZDC – Zoning & Development Code: Adopted by Mayor and Council on January 20, 2005, effective February 22, 2005, the ZDC implements Tempe General Plan 2030 by encouraging creative development of the built environment in order to build a community that promotes the livability and uniqueness of Tempe; establishes zoning districts and development standards.