Tempe Historic Preservation Commission

AGENDA

Date: THURSDAY, November 14, 2013

Location: Hatton Hall, 34 E 7th Street, Tempe (parking in City Hall Garage)
                                      6:00 PM Call to Order, sign in, introductions, (please mute cell phones)

1. Call to Audience: Persons wishing to address the commission on any matter may do so at the discretion of the Chair, however, Arizona Open Meeting Law limits commission discussion to matters listed on the posted agenda. Other topics may be placed on a future agenda for discussion.

2. Approval of HPC Minutes
   09/12/2013 Tempe HPC Monthly meeting

3. Discuss & Consider HE classification process
   General discussion and consideration of how to proceed with Historic Eligible classification program

4. Discuss & Consider Proposed Cavalier Hills Historic District Designation
   HPO update on a community directed proposed mid-century modern historic district designation

5. Discuss & Consider HP General Plan 2040
   General discussion of Historic Preservation in the context of General Plan 2040

6. Discuss and Consider Graduate Student Intern Program Projects
   Alyssa) Moeur Park WPA Structures National Register Nomination
   Billy) Kirkland McKinney Ditch National Register Nomination
   Andrea/ Joe) Historic Preservation Graduate Student Intern Program update

7. Discuss and Consider Chair / Staff Updates:
   Tempe HPO Social Media Project n=2903 http://www.facebook.com/TempeHPO
   Tempe HPF Social Media Project n=1336 http://www.facebook.com/TempeHPF

8. Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items
   - Member Announcements
   - Staff Announcements
     Mark/Anne) AIA National Colloquium on Designing with Historic Properties at Taliesin West
     December HPC Meeting will be cancelled – Next HPC meeting 01/09/2013 at Hatton Hall

Adjourn

To date in 2013 commission members report donating  452  volunteer hours to the City of Tempe

The City of Tempe endeavors to make all public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. Within 48 hours notice, special assistance can be provided for sight and/or hearing impaired persons at public meetings. Please call (480) 350-8007 (voice) or 350-8400 (TDD) to request accommodation.
City of Tempe, Arizona

Notice of Public Meeting of a Public Body

Sections 7.6.3, 7.7.4, 7.10.1

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING OF THE

TEMPE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Tempe Historic Preservation Commission and to the general public that the Tempe Historic Preservation Commission will hold a meeting open to the public on Thursday, November 14, 2013, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m., at Hatton Hall, located on the Governor B. B. Moeur Campus at 34 East 7th Street, Tempe, Arizona.

A copy of the agenda for the meeting will be available at Tempe City Hall, 31 East 5th Street, Garden Level East, Community Development Department, Historic Preservation Office at least twenty-four hours in advance of the meeting.

Dated this 5th day of November, 2013

Tempe Historic Preservation Commission

[Signature]

Persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the Tempe City Clerk, 480-350-8007 (voice), or 480-350-8400 (TDD). Requests should be made as early as possible to arrange the accommodation.
Tempe Historic Preservation Commission [Tempe HPC]

MEETING MINUTES

Date: THURSDAY, September 12, 2013

Location: Hatton Hall 34 East Seventh Street

Commissioners Present: Ira Bennett, Anne Bilsbarrow, Andrea Gregory, Korri Turner

Staff Present: Alyssa Gerszewski, Hansen, Billy Kiser, Joe Nucci, Mark Vinson

Public Present: Patti Olson, Chuck Buss, Nancy Jain

Call to Order: 6:00 P.M., Andrea Gregory, Chair

1. Call to Audience  NO REPLY

2. Approval of HPC Minutes 8/08/2013 Tempe HPC meeting

MOTION [TURNER]: MOVE TO APPROVE TEMPE HPC MEETING MINUTES FROM 08/08/2013, SECOND [BILSBARROW], APPROVED, 4-0

3. Arizona State University – Historic Preservation Coordinator Update

Olson: Summarizes update on preservation activities on ASU, Tempe campus. Exterior restoration of Birchett House will be repurposed as an outdoor dining area. Exterior work is occurring at the University Club. The rehabilitation of Manzanita Hall is now complete. The art annex will be repurposed as a restaurant. Certain works of public art will be conserved.

4. Discuss & Consider Tempe Preservation Global Perspective

- Jain: Stresses the need for an historic preservation plan for Tempe outside of the General Plan 2040. Presents the benefits of planning.
- Jain: Discusses similarities in preservation/conservation in the United States and India.
- Jain: Discusses financial incentives for historic preservation. Stresses the what, why, who, how of preservation in Tempe. Summarizes the HP commission powers and duties.
- Olson: What is the biggest difference between the world and US approach?
- Jain: Government-owned property and private property. Private property laws are strong in the US.
- Bennett: The economic perspective is essential. Are our arguments resonating with our different audiences? How effective are they?
- Nucci, Gregory, Buss: Discuss the tax advantage and quality of life arguments for historic districts and other homeowner benefits.
- Turner: Safety is a social argument, but an important one in a neighborhood context.
5. Discuss & Consider Proposed Cavalier Hills Historic District Designation
- Gerszewski: Summarizes events of August 22nd and September 7th informal neighborhood meetings.
- Nucci: Discusses neighborhood opposition, waivers, new neighborhood coalition, and September 21st meeting at North Tempe Generational Center.
- Gerszewski: Discusses Recommendation of Potential Eligibility (ROPE) application prepared for SHPO. Several homes need further evaluation.
- Nucci: The survey and inventory of 188 single-family homes was included in ROPE application.
- Nucci: About 70 property owners have attended three informal meetings. Some neighbors attended more than one.
- Buss: Explains his role in neighborhood meetings and shares his personal experiences from living in a historic district.

6. Discuss & Consider HE Classification Process
- Nucci: City Attorney would like questions in advance before comment.
- Gregory: Is HE classification a taking? We need City Attorney’s opinion on this.
- Nucci: Will look for previous correspondence with City Attorney in order to determine this.
- Gregory: Shears and Proper to create a brochure?
- Nucci: Yes, it will be prepared for the next THPC packet.

7. Discuss & Consider Graduate Student Intern Program Projects
- Gerszewski & Nucci: scheduled to speak at Hackett House 125th Anniversary event on September 18th
- Kiser: Kirkland-McKinney Ditch is pending with the Keeper of the National Register.
- Kiser: Tempe Municipal Building sent back for area of significance corrections. Possibly wait 5 years so criteria G won’t be necessary argument.
- Gregory: New Arizona SHPO advice “How to Prepare a National Register Nomination” has been distributed.
- Kiser: Summarizes Concord Village project; prepared historic contexts.
- Gregory: Will a new intern fill Hallam’s spot?
- Nucci: Yes, when the right individual presents themselves. Tempe City Council approved funding for graduate student intern program.

8. Discuss and Consider Chair/Staff Updates:
- Gregory: Will we create new definition of Heritage Area or Cultural Resource Area?
- Nucci & Bennett: Will meet and discuss this. It may be on October THPC agenda.
- Bilsbarrow: What is the status of the NRN for the Hayden Flour Mill?
- Nucci: The NRN is on hold [ending Council release.

9. Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items
Next HPC Meeting Date Thursday 10/10/2013 at 6:00 p.m. at Hatton Hall, 34 E. 7th Street

Meeting adjourned at 7:45 pm

Andrea Gregory, Chair

-minutes scheduled for HPC approval on 10/10/2013
FREQUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS OR ACRONYMS

- CDD – City of Tempe Community Development Department: Established February 15, 2005, by City Manager Will Manley. The CDD consists of six divisions; Economic Development, Housing Services, Redevelopment, Neighborhood Enhancement, Rio Salado/Town Lake, and Special Projects, as well as the Community Design Studio / City Architect. The Tempe Historic Preservation Office is an agency of the Special Projects Division.

- CLG – Certified Local Government: In 1980, Congress established a framework for local preservation programs through an amendment to the National Historic Preservation Act empowering Arizona cities and counties to become Certified Local Governments (CLGs). Once certified, these entities are eligible for specialized assistance and funds for developing their own local preservation programs and entitled to comment on NR and other SHPO activities within their boundaries. The City of Tempe became a CLG in 1995.

- DDA – Development & Disposition Agreement: a redevelopment contract between the City and one or more developers or redevelopers specifying terms and conditions for construction or reconstruction.

- DSD – City of Tempe Development Services Department: dealing with Building Safety, Land Use, Planning and Zoning.


- GRIC – Gila River Indian Community: is an alliance of two tribes, the Akimel O'odham (Pima) and the Pee Posh (Maricopa). Established by Executive Order in 1859, the Community covers more than 600 square miles and is the largest indigenous community in the Phoenix metropolitan area. GRIC helps make the Tempe Preservation Graduate Student Intern Program possible through a generous grant of State-Shared Revenue funds.

- HPF – (see Tempe HPF) Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation

- HSRC – (Arizona) Historic Sites Review Committee: Arizona's official Arizona and National Register of Historic Places review board. The HSRC meets three times during the year to review National Register nominations and advise the State Historic Preservation Officer on nominations to the State and National Registers.

- IEBC – International Existing Building Code: adopted by Tempe City Council by Ordinance No. 2005.89 on December 1, 2005, as part of the code body promulgated by the International Code Council, provides means for preservation of existing Tempe building inventory through reasonable and feasible code processes.

- IRS – Issue Review Session: informal Mayor and Council public meeting where members of the public may come forward and talk with City Council during the “Call to the Audience” prior to regular Council meetings.

- NPS – National Park Service: the City of Tempe is a Certified Local Government through an inter-governmental agreement with the United States Department of the Interior National Park Service and the Arizona State Historic Preservation Office.

- NRN – National Register Nomination: An application to list a property on the National Register of Historic Places is reviewed by the SHPO and then by the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee (Sites) before formal application is made to the Keeper of the National Register in Washington DC.

- PAD – Planned Area Development: site plan overlay to define development standards for a specific project.

- SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office: a division of Arizona State Parks, responsible for the identification, evaluation, and protection of Arizona's prehistoric and historic cultural resources; established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.

- SRP-MIC – Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community: created by Executive Order on June 14, 1879 by President Rutherford B. Hayes, the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRPMIC) is located in Maricopa County, aside the boundaries of Mesa, Tempe, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills and metropolitan Phoenix.

- Tempe HPC – Tempe Historic Preservation Commission: Created by Ordinance 95.35, adopted November 9, 1995. Members serve three year terms with the exception of the initial appointments; charged with administering the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance and Plan, as well as advising Mayor / Council on all matters related to historic preservation.


- Tempe HPO – Tempe Historic Preservation Office: Responsible for the identification and conservation of Tempe’s prehistoric and historic cultural resources, the Office uses Federal, state, and city funding for the historic preservation program and assists owners of historic properties with grant applications, property maintenance, and preservation activities; provides staff support to the Tempe HPC.

- THM – Tempe Historical Museum: Located at 809 E. Southern Avenue in Tempe, the Tempe Historical Museum is a center where the community comes together to celebrate Tempe’s past and ponder the future. Permanent and changing exhibits, educational programs, and research projects generally focus on some aspect of Tempe's history within the context of state and national events.

- TOD – Tempe Transportation Overlay District: placed to encourage appropriate land development and redevelopment consistent with and complementary to the community’s focused investment in transit, bicycle, and pedestrian infrastructure in certain geographic areas of the City; typically in association with the light rail.

- ZDC – Zoning & Development Code: Adopted by Mayor and Council on January 20, 2005, effective February 22, 2005, the ZDC implements Tempe General Plan 2030 by encouraging creative development of the built environment in order to build a community that promotes the livability and uniqueness of Tempe; establishes zoning districts and development standards.
Hello Joe, in answer to your message below, it is our opinion that the act of placing a 30 day hold on demolition creates a remote, yet possible, prop 207 issue for affected property owners. They would have to prove that their land is less valuable on the market as a result of this regulation, and I think it is fairly unlikely that a court would see such a delay as sufficient evidence of diminution in value. That being said, since it is always desirable to get the buy-in of the land owner in these situations, it might be prudent to track those owners who object to designation prior to the determination, and then choose as a matter of policy to not delay their demolition permits when the request comes. That way, they would have no injury, and the regulation would remain in place for everyone else. Thanks, Andrew

Andrew B. Ching
City Attorney

Andrew,  

City Code Section 14A-4(j) [http://www.tempe.gov/citycode/14aHistoricPreservation.htm](http://www.tempe.gov/citycode/14aHistoricPreservation.htm) provides a straight-forward procedure for the HP commission to identify the candidate field of community cultural resources from which historic property designations may be drawn and to keep track of the condition of those candidates that have not been designated. Classifying a property Historic Eligible can open up a dialog with property owners which might eventually lead to historic designation and listing these properties on the Tempe HP Register [http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres/register.html](http://www.tempe.gov/historicpres/register.html).
The commission has not taken this action since 2006 when voters approved Prop 207 and the city began taking waivers for any zoning action requested. However, the effects of classification are described in § 14A-6(g) and § 14A-7(k) do not apply overlay zoning but merely places eligible properties on a list, allowing up to 30 days for staff clearance of permits sought for alteration or demolition. The commission has identified 10 properties for classification as Historic Eligible. Each of these properties has been listed on the National Register of Historic Places but none are listed locally. HPO respectfully requests your opinion as to the continued viability of the process for classification of properties as Historic Eligible prior to proceeding with the action requested by the commission.
Hey fellow Historic District Supporters,

I have the final news from Jeff Kulaga, the Assistant Tempe City Manager, on the election for the Cavalier Hills Neighborhood Hood Association Chairman. The election will now be scheduled for the evening of November 14th at the North Tempe Multi-Generational Center. Postcards will be sent out by the city early next week with this notification.

Jeff also told me that the city feels that the Historic District Waivers should not be sent out during the holidays. The earliest possible date being January 15th from their point of view for this to be scheduled.

We can discuss this all on Saturday morning and make plans accordingly based on what we all decide.

Again we will be meeting at Philly's Sports Bar at 10 am.

And a big thanks to all of you for staying with this effort. Persistence and determination will always win out.

See you Saturday -- Mike Jones

See you there

On Mon, Oct 21, 2013 at 5:12 PM, Jones Mik <granitemtn@gmail.com> wrote:
Teammates,

Here are 2 pieces of good news:

1) I have checked with Philly's and we are scheduled to meet there at 10 am on Saturday. They are very receptive to having us.

2) I had a long conversation with Jeff Kulaga, the Assistant City Manager of Tempe, this afternoon. He has committed to getting back to us tomorrow with resolution on having an election held for the Cavalier Hills Neighborhood Association Chair. It is my perception that all of your phone calls have started to move implicit opinion in our favor at City Hall and will be probably be reflected in the City Council vote after we achieve a majority of notarized waivers. Jeff was very impressed with all of the organization and work that all of you have completed in this effort. I will keep all of you updated with this as it develops.

Thanks for being part of our team -- Mike Jones
What's the appeal?

Local historic district designation has proved to insulate property values from wild swings in the housing market, including downturns tied to large economic trends, and “bubbles” caused by cycles of real estate speculation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Area</th>
<th>Data Interval</th>
<th>Ave. Value Difference (%)</th>
<th>Annual Rate (%)</th>
<th>Reference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Denver, CO</td>
<td>1993-2000</td>
<td>+3.6</td>
<td>+4.1</td>
<td>Clamon Assoc of CO 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durango, CO</td>
<td>1993-2000</td>
<td>+7</td>
<td>+1</td>
<td>Clamon Assoc of CO 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memphis, TN</td>
<td>1998-2002</td>
<td>+14.23</td>
<td>+3.5-5.7</td>
<td>Coulton and Lahr 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mesa, AZ</td>
<td>1997-2004</td>
<td>+26</td>
<td>+3.7</td>
<td>Bellavia 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phoenix, AZ</td>
<td>2005</td>
<td>+31</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>Poppen 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>San Diego, CA</td>
<td>2000-2005</td>
<td>+16</td>
<td>+3.2</td>
<td>Narvold 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Savannah, GA</td>
<td>1974-1997</td>
<td>+264.588</td>
<td>+11.5-25.6</td>
<td>Leithe and Tigue 1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas (9 cities)</td>
<td>(variable)</td>
<td>+5.20</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>Leichenedo et al. 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tifton, GA</td>
<td>1983-1996</td>
<td>+2</td>
<td>+.2</td>
<td>Leithe and Tigue 1999</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Property Values* in Designated Historic Districts Compared to Similar Undesignated Neighborhoods in the Same Communities

* Phoenix and Mesa studies used sales values; all other studies used assessed values

Source: http://www.preservationnj.org

Increase in owner-occupancy. Having homeowners as neighbors and NOT renters.

Decreased nuisance violations and police calls for service.

You will NOT be subject to additional regulatory control of your property!

It’s on our minds; and its time to get Cavalier Hills registered as a Tempe Historic District.

Know the facts (see back side for more details.)

If a community did nothing but protect its historic neighborhoods it will have advanced every Smart Growth principle. Historic preservation IS Smart Growth.

Paid for by neighbors who support Cavalier Hills Historic District.
For more information contact sshanion1@cox.net

In the last three decades of the 20th century, we lost from our national inventory of older and historic homes 6.3 million year-round housing units!

The protection of local historic districts can enhance business recruitment potential. Companies continually re-locate to communities that offer their workers a higher quality of life, which is greatly enhanced by successful local preservation programs and stable historic districts.
Just the Facts!

Fact: There are over more than 2,300 local historic districts in the United States.

Fact: Tempe has four designated Historic Districts, they are: Borden Homes, Date Palm Manor, Roosevelt Addition and Tomlinson Estates.

Fact: The 343 houses located in the four Tempe Historic Districts represent approximately one half of one percent of the total community housing stock.

Fact: Historical and cultural resources are being preserved as a living part of our community to give a sense of temporal orientation to the American People.

Fact: You can opt out. There is an opt-out period that allows individual homeowners to opt out by filing the OPTION form within three years. Even if you vote to approve the Historic District!

Fact: This is not a homeowners association and no rule of law with Historic District designation.

Fact: Two laws in place to control taxes ARS 42-13301; Ratio of value is 5% ½ normal taxable value. ARS 42-15006 5% increase on limited property value per same year (same as normal assessor property valuation).

Fact: Waiver of rights is required by the City of Tempe for any requested zoning action including Historic District Designation.

Fact: Many local businesses endorse Cavalier Hills Historic District.

Fact: Neighbors who support Cavalier Hills Historic District are not associated with the City of Tempe or any developer.

FACT

Many of your neighbors have done the research and have the answers to the questions you might have. Email us, we will be happy to inform you and would look forward to helping you make the decision that’s right for you.

cavalierhills@gmail.com

Paid for by neighbors who support Cavalier Hills Historic District.