Tempe Historic Preservation Commission [Tempe HPC]

MEETING MINUTES

Date: THURSDAY, September 13, 2012

Location: Hatton Hall 34 East Seventh Street

Commissioners Present: Brad Graham        Korri Turner
                      Andrea Gregory          Ira Bennett
                      Anne Bilsbarrow          Brenda Shears
                      Scott Solliday

Staff Present: Kris Baxter        Amy Douglass
              Alyssa Gerszewski     Billy Kiser
              Joe Nucci              Jared Smith
              Mark Vinson

Public Present: John Kane
              Vic Linoff
              Jennifer (ASU)
              Patricia Oliveria-Lauderdale
              Mary O’Grady (THMAB)

Call to Order: 6:03 P.M., Andrea Gregory, Chair

1. Call to Audience No Comment

2. Approval of HPC Minutes 08/09/2012 Tempe HPC meeting and
   MOTION [TURNER]: MOVE TO APPROVE TEMPE HPC MEETING
   MINUTES, AS AMENDED, FROM 08/09/2012, SECOND [GRAHAM],
   APPROVED, 6-0

3. Discuss & Consider Tempe Bakery Hackett House Alterations
   • Mark Vinson update on proposed changes to Hackett House
   • Sister Cities Org. wants to add permanent courtyard pavilion on east side
   • Will serve as a permanent events center
   • Presentation by architect John Kane on proposed addition/alterations
   • Proposal will bring restrooms into ADA compliance
   • Current storage facility will become restroom facility, and vice versa
   • None of the alterations will touch the historic structure
   • “Compatible yet distinct” is guiding principle for architectural modifications
   • Attempting to attain a “garden-type” feel
   • New restrooms will be accessed by passages, not shown on floor plan
   • The entire compound will be considered one building, for code purposes
   • Discussion on the window arches and their practicality/impracticality
   • Architects working within a limited Sister Cities Org. budget
   • Capacity of new pavilion will be approximately 120 people
   • History overview: current pavilion site used to be a horse stable c. 1900
   • New architecture incorporates extensive glass windows
   • Windows might encourage vandalism, but building is in a downtown area,
   and that possibility will exist no matter what
   • Architectural proposal to be heard by Council September 20
The concept, as presented by Mark Vinson and John Kane was generally well-received by the Commission with the following comments:
1. Pedestrian circulation through the proposed storage area could be problematic.
2. Consider separation requirements per the building code.
3. Consider enclosing the proposed exterior buffet space.
4. Architectural character (“compatible, yet distinct;” “of its time”) is appropriate; references to arched windows and brick of historic Hackett House structures as shown are good, but don’t get too “heavy-handed.”
5. “Lantern” effect is lovely, but vandalism may be a concern with so much glass.
6. Consensus expressed that the concept as presented was viable.

**CONSENSUS: COMMISSION SUPPORT FOR BUILDING DESIGN AS PRESENTED**

4. Hayden Flour Mill + Silo Activities
   - Kris Baxter Update on Mill fundraising event to be held October 5, 2012
   - Tempe HPF will be guiding tours. Approx. 200 tours already booked.
   - Additional volunteer guides solicited
   - Those wishing to serve as guides can contact Joe Nucci or Andrea Gregory
   - Food vendors offering free samples at grand opening event
   - Mission Palms hotel parking lot available for parking at grand opening
   - Expecting 1000-3000 attendees
   - A second event/tour date will be scheduled for later in October to accommodate demand
   - Donation boxes will be set up for visitors wishing to contribute to preservation efforts
   - Tours might have both a leader and a “trailer” at the end of the group
   - HPO interns will prepare talking points for group guides
   - SRP-MIC president will be speaking at grand opening
   - We will find out in coming weeks whether other members of the tribal council will be attending
   - Staff is working with the tribe to ensure we have the appropriate Native American music and blessing at the event as well
   - Entertainment will feature musical styles that conform with local cultures
   - Volunteers get free parking at event
   - HPO considering a historic landmark designation for the Hayden Flour Mill & Silos
   - HPC (Solliday) will prepare a letter of support for landmark designation to Council

**CONSENSUS: COMMISSION (SOLLIDAY) TO PROVIDE LETTER OF SUPPORT FOR DESIGNATION AND LISTING ON THE TEMPE HISTORIC PROPERTY REGISTER**

5. Discuss & Consider Commission/Council Liaison Assignments
   - Mark Vinson brought architectural renderings and Jared Smith brought historic photos, to be presented to council members
   - HPC members will focus on two talking points with council members: Borden Homes design guidelines success, and possible creation of historic preservation awards
   - Gregory brought one-page summary of historic preservation economic incentives, to be presented to council members
   - HPO will provide copies of Borden Homes design guidelines, to be presented to council members
   - Commissioners will meet with council members by the end of October

**CONSENSUS: COMMISSION MEMBERS TO ARRANGE MEETING IN OCTOBER**
6. **Discuss & Consider Historic Eligible Classification**
   - Joe Nucci overview of “historic eligible” (HE) classification
   - HE is not equivalent to historic designation and listing on the historic property register
   - Any national register property is automatically a candidate for HE classification
   - HE classification only requires one public hearing at HPC
   - HE classification could be an interim step towards official historic designation and listing
   - Nucci: overview of properties to be considered for HE classification
   - Currently 18 properties have been identified eligible for HE classification
   - Discussion on the level of detail to be provided in HE classification property reports. In general, only a brief historic/architectural summary is necessary
   - Five properties on 900 block of Mill Ave. have recently sold to Armstrong Development, LLC
   - Discussion on making all five aforementioned properties HE classification
   - Only effect of this action would be to postpone any demolition for 30 days
   - HE classification does not require property owner consent
   - HE classification can be appealed to Council
   - Discussion: Commission should not place all 5 Mill Ave. properties on agenda for consideration as HE; instead, only the Mullen-Van Petten House should be considered because it is already a national register property.
   - Maple Ash Neighborhood Assn. might become involved once they learn about recent property sale and potential redevelopment
   - These properties already have commercial zoning and have been sold as a single block property
   - Gonzales-Martinez House (1880) is still in litigation pending court appeal
   - HPO advised by Redevelopment staff to do nothing until litigation is completed
   - Four properties (Andre Bldg., Vienna Bakery, Borden Creamery, and Walker House) will be placed on October agenda for HE classification.

**CONSENSUS:** RESUME PROCESS WITH 4 NATIONAL REGISTER LISTED DOWNTOWN PROPERTIES AT OCTOBER 11 MEETING

7. **Discuss & Consider General Plan 2040 Update**
   - Single/Multi-Family Subdivision Maps have been completed
   - Nathan and Alyssa G met recently with commissioner Brad Graham regarding at-risk properties, areas of intensified activity, and mixed-use spaces
   - Sketches of historic properties will be incorporated into GP2040
   - Proposal to rewrite the historic preservation plan for GP2040
   - Anne Bilsbarrow, Brad Graham, Billy Kiser, and Joe Nucci to collaborate on rewrite of historic preservation plan
   - This will require council approval because a meeting of the four above individuals would constitute a subcommittee under city ordinance
   - Nucci will seek council authorization before this proceeds

8. **Discuss & Consider Graduate Student Intern Program Updates**
   - Kiser: Double Butte Cemetery NRN scheduled for November HSRC meeting
   - Kiser: Kirkland-McKinney Ditch NRN has been submitted to SHPO by Nathan Hallam
   - Kiser: SHPO has given an opinion that Sandra Day O’Connor House is NOT eligible for the national register
   - SHPO has indicated that NRN for Tempe Municipal Building will NOT be reviewed at HSRC because of mid-century modern architecture and criteria considerations relative to the property’s age
• Nucci: HPO might try pursuing nomination of Tempe Municipal Building based on Criteria A instead of Criteria C.
• Gerszewski: Continuing work on NRN for Moeur Park WPA Structures

9. Presentation – Cultural Resource Area
   Continued to next meeting

10. Discuss & Consider Chair / Staff Updates
    Gregory: Update re: upcoming meeting with Phoenix HPC on multi-city preservation initiative. Date pending Ira Bennett’s availability

11. Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items
    Next HPC Meeting Date Thursday 10/11/2012 6:00 p.m. at Hatton Hall, 34 E. 7th Street

Meeting adjourned at 7:47 PM

Andrea Gregory, Chair
- minutes scheduled for HPC approval on 10/11/2012
FREQUENTLY USED ABBREVIATIONS OR ACRONYMS

- CDD – City of Tempe Community Development Department; Established February 15, 2005, by City Manager Will Manley. The CDD consists of six divisions; Economic Development, Housing Services, Redevelopment, Neighborhood Enhancement, Rio Salado/Town Lake, and Special Projects, as well as the Community Design Studio / City Architect. The Tempe Historic Preservation Office is an agency of the Special Projects Division.
- CLG – Certified Local Government: In 1980, Congress established a framework for local preservation programs through an amendment to the National Historic Preservation Act empowering Arizona cities and counties to become Certified Local Governments (CLGs). Once certified, these entities are eligible for specialized assistance and funds for developing their own local preservation programs and entitled to comment on NR and other SHPO activities within their boundaries. The City of Tempe became a CLG in 1995.
- DDA – Development & Disposition Agreement: a redevelopment contract between the City and one or more developers or redevelopers specifying terms and conditions for construction or reconstruction.
- DSD – City of Tempe Development Services Department: dealing with Building Safety, Land Use, Planning and Zoning.
- GRIC – Gila Indian Indian Community: is an alliance of two tribes, the Akimel O’dodham (Pima) and the Pee Posh (Maricopa). Established by Executive Order in 1859, the Community covers more than 600 square miles and is the largest indigenous community in the Phoenix metropolitan area. GRIC helps make the Tempe Preservation Graduate Student Intern Program possible through a generous grant of State-Shared Revenue funds.
- HPF – (see Tempe HPF) Tempe Historic Preservation Foundation.
- HSRC – (Arizona) Historic Sites Review Committee: Arizona’s official Arizona and National Register of Historic Places review board. The HSRC meets three times during the year to review National Register nominations and advise the State Historic Preservation Officer on nominations to the State and National Registers.
- IECB – International Existing Building Code: adopted by Tempe City Council by Ordinance No. 2005.89 on December 1, 2005, as part of the code body promulgated by the International Code Council, provides means for preservation of existing Tempe building inventory through reasonable and feasible code processes.
- IRS – Issue Review Session: informal Mayor and Council public meeting where members of the public may come forward and talk with City Council during the “Call to the Audience” prior to regular Council meetings.
- NPS – National Park Service: the City of Tempe is a Certified Local Government through an inter-governmental agreement with the United States Department of the Interior National Park Service and the Arizona State Historic Preservation Office.
- NRR – National Register Nomination: An application to list a property on the National Register of Historic Places is reviewed by the SHPO and then by the Arizona Historic Sites Review Committee (Sites) before formal application is made to the Keeper of the National Register in Washington DC.
- PAD – Planned Area Development: site plan overlay to define development standards for a specific project.
- SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office: a division of Arizona State Parks, responsible for the identification, evaluation, and protection of Arizona’s prehistoric and historic cultural resources; established by the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966.
- SRP-MIC – Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community: created by Executive Order on June 14, 1879 by President Rutherford B. Hayes, the Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community (SRPMIC) is located in Maricopa County, aside the boundaries of Mesa, Tempe, Scottsdale, Fountain Hills and metropolitan Phoenix.
- Tempe HPC – Tempe Historic Preservation Commission: Created by Ordinance 95.35, adopted November 9, 1995. Members serve three year terms with the exception of the initial appointments; charged with administering the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance and Plan, as well as advising Mayor / Council on all matters related to historic preservation.
- Tempe HPO – Tempe Historic Preservation Office: Responsible for the identification and conservation of Tempe’s prehistoric and historic cultural resources, the Office uses Federal, state, and city funding for the historic preservation program and assists owners of historic properties with grant applications, property maintenance, and preservation activities; provides staff support to the Tempe HPC.
- THM – Tempe Historical Museum: Located at 809 E. Southern Avenue in Tempe, the Tempe Historical Museum is a center where the community comes together to celebrate Tempe’s past and ponder the future. Permanent and changing exhibits, educational programs, and research projects generally focus on some aspect of Tempe’s history within the context of state and national events.
- TOD – Tempe Transportation Overlay District: placed to encourage appropriate land development and redevelopment consistent with and complementary to the community’s focused investment in transit, bicycle, and pedestrian infrastructure in certain geographic areas of the City; typically in association with the light rail.
- ZDC – Zoning & Development Code: Adopted by Mayor and Council on January 20, 2005, effective February 22, 2005, the ZDC implements Tempe General Plan 2020 by encouraging creative development of the built environment in order to build a community that promotes the livability and uniqueness of Tempe; establishes zoning districts and development standards.